

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

In Mosa, and within Burns Presbyterian Church, the Presbytery of London met in Regular Session on Tuesday, the fourteenth day of January, two thousand and fourteen, at the hour of seven o'clock in the evening.

- Constitution** The Moderator, the Reverend Andrew Reid, welcomed everyone to the meeting and constituted the Court with prayer.
- Worship** The Worship Service was led by the Reverend Charlotte Brown.
- Welcome, Courtesies and Announcements** The Moderator extended a welcome to all present. R. Shaw introduced Ian Fleck, representative elder for Knox St. Andrew's. Margaret McCullough represented the WMS.
- Attendance** Charlotte Brown, Mavis Currie, Tom Godfrey, Ed Hoekstra, Jacob Lee, Keith McKee, John Park, Heather Paton, Andrew Reid, Robert Shaw, Kevin Steeper, Jon Van Den Berg, Kate Ballagh-Steeper, Jim Redpath, Ministers; Bob Baron, John Cameron, Janet Donkervoort, Ruth Ann Drozd, Ian Fleck, Tom Jeffery, Debbie Kemp, Michael Kernahan, David Laphorne, Patrick Laurin, Jain Mahabir, Joan Mansell, Marg McCullough, Linda McKenna, Bill McMurchy, Nancy Newell, Barbara Nyitray, Angela Osborne, Don Speir, Gerald Stocking, Joan Taylor, Donna Jean Van Bilsen, Trudy Van Der Hoek, Peter VanderKooy, Elders; John Van Eyk, Lay Missionary; Lu Brule, Treasurer; Carrie Thornton, Clerk; Sharon Gilchrist, Karen Carroll, Alan Carroll, Annie Isobel Tait, Kay Dymock, Tom McLarty, Argyle Presbyterian Church; Paul McWilliam, Duff Presbyterian Church; Ross MacKay, Knollwood Presbyterian Church.
- Regrets** John Bannerman, William Khalil, Amanda MacMillan, Michael Stol, Ministers; Sheila McMurray, Nancy Springer, Elders.
- Absent** Deb Dolbear-VanBilsen, Ryan Kim, Mark Turner, Ministers; Matt Marshall, Sandra VanDerVeen, Elders.
- Docket** **MOTION:** (Baron/Mahabir) THAT the Docket as circulated be adopted for the meeting. CARRIED.
- Minutes** **MOTION:** (Mahabir/McKee) THAT the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Presbytery of London, held on November 12, 2013, be adopted as circulated. CARRIED.
- Report of the Administrative Team** The Moderator invited the Clerk, C. Thornton, to present the Report of the Administrative Team.

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

CORRESPONDENCE

RECOMMENDATION #1 (Jeffery/Shaw) THAT the following correspondence be received for information: CARRIED.

Number	From	Regarding
14-2	Life & Mission Agency	Almanarah grant approval
14-3	Committee on Education & Reception	competent objections to applications
14-5	E. Bartlett, Assembly office	changes to the roll

RECOMMENDATION #2 (Jeffery/Shaw) THAT the following correspondence be referred as named: CARRIED.

Number	From	Regarding	Refer To
14-1	Life & Mission Agency	Cdn Ministries documents	Clerk
14-4	Life & Mission Agency	Rural & remote summer students	circ. elect. rural charges
14-6	S. Farris, St. Andrew's Hall	position descriptions	denom work team.
14-7	H. Chappell, Stewardship	Presbyterians Sharing update	circ. elect.
14-8	J. Archer-Green, Synod Clerk	2013 update	circ. elect.
14-9	A. VanderMeulen	application for PCC approval	student & ed team
14-10	J. Leitch, Clerk of Session, Duff	letters forwarded by Session	vacancy & visit

RECOMMENDATION #3 (Shaw/Steeper) THAT Ian Fleck be appointed representative elder for Knox St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church. CARRIED.

RECOMMENDATION #4 (Mahabir/Laurin) THAT the Moderator be granted power to issue to appoint an Interim Moderator for Knox St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church after the exit interview is complete. CARRIED.

Records Examination **MOTION:** (Van Der Hoek/ Van Bilsen) THAT the Session Records of Westmount Presbyterian Church, London be attested as being neatly and correctly kept. CARRIED.

Beginning the Conversation K. Steeper thanked everyone who attended the event on Saturday. The committee will be meeting to determine the next steps.

Presbyterians Sharing B. Baron advised the Court that the final report will be circulated when available. He asked that the 2014 commitments be forwarded as soon as possible.

Committee to Visit Argyle And Duff K. McKee summarized the two reports previously circulated.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozdz) THAT Rev. Ryan Kim be placed on a paid leave of absence from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014. CARRIED.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozd) THAT the cost of pulpit supply from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014 be paid from the General Funds of the Presbytery of London. CARRIED.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozd) THAT power to issue be given to the Moderator of Presbytery to appoint an interim moderator and that the costs of the interim moderator be paid by the Presbytery of London from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014. CARRIED.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozd) THAT, before any future call is processed to Mr. Kim, he seek private tutoring or classes in effective writing and communications and that he demonstrate that his English language skills have improved. CARRIED.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozd) THAT the Presbytery of London pay up to \$2,500 to offset the costs of Mr. Kim's tutoring in English and that the Presbytery of London receive reports that Mr. Kim is indeed engaging in tutoring and is making progress. CARRIED.

MOTION: (McKee/Godfrey) THAT should Rev. Kim not continue with his studies, that he repay the balance of his tuition to the Presbytery within two months. CARRIED.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozd) THAT the Reverend Keith McKee and the Moderator of Presbytery meet with the Rev. Dr. Dorcas Gordon, Principal of Knox College and the Rev. Dr. Pamela McCarroll, Assistant Professor of Pastoral Theology & Director of Theological Field Education to express the Presbytery's concerns about the preparedness of ministers for whom English is a second language and for whom Canadian Presbyterian culture may not be their own. CARRIED.

K. McKee advised that the Presbytery will receive a report on this meeting.

MOTION: (McKee/Drozd) THAT the January 8, 2014 report and the report of the committee dated December 13, 2013 be attached to the minutes of the Presbytery and the certificate of Mr. Kim. CARRIED.

After discussion about the meaning of "theological uncertainty" and how this question would be addressed, K. McKee suggested that the Committee to visit Argyle and Duff and the Student and Education Team work together to determine the best way to proceed. AGREED.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

R. Shaw noted the large amount of work that has gone into this issue and expressed gratitude for the work of the committee and for the thoughtful recommendations.

B. McMurchy, representative elder for Crinan and Duff stood and read several letters supporting Rev. R. Kim.

MOTION: (McMurchy/) THAT the report on ministry at Crinan be received and appended to the report from the Visitations and Vacancies Committee, and that the Crinan Report be added as a footnote to the Committee Report. **MOTION NOT SECONDED.**

MOTION: (McMurchy/) THAT the Rev. Ryan Kim be the supply minister at Crinan until April 30, 2014. **MOTION NOT SECONDED.**

MOTION: (McMurchy/Park) THAT the report on ministry at Crinan and related motions be received.

MOTION: (Park/Fleck) THAT the motion on ministry at Crinan and related motions be tabled. **CARRIED.**

The Court **AGREED** to allow the Clerk of Session at Crinan Presbyterian Church to address the Court. The Clerk of Session asked to have the Presbytery address the motion regarding pulpit supply since it is time sensitive.

The Moderator ruled that the pulpit supply issue requires a Notice of Motion.

Notice of Motion

R. Shaw made the following notice of motion: THAT I would move or cause to be moved, that the Presbytery of London at a future meeting, reconsider the motion to place the Rev. Ryan Kim on a paid leave of absence.

Adjournment

MOTION: (McKee/Jeffery) THAT the meeting be adjourned at five minutes before nine o'clock in the evening to reconvene in seven minutes to deal with the remainder of the docket. **CARRIED.**

The Moderator closed the meeting with prayer.

Moderator

Clerk

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

In Mosa, and within Burns Presbyterian Church, the Presbytery of London met in Regular Session on Tuesday, the fourteenth day of January, two thousand and fourteen, at the hour of seven minutes after nine o'clock in the evening.

- Constitution** The Moderator, the Reverend Andrew Reid, welcomed everyone to the meeting and constituted the Court with prayer.
- Attendance** Charlotte Brown, Mavis Currie, Tom Godfrey, Ed Hoekstra, Jacob Lee, Keith McKee, John Park, Heather Paton, Andrew Reid, Robert Shaw, Kevin Steeper, Jon Van Den Berg, Kate Ballagh-Steeper, Jim Redpath, Ministers; Bob Baron, John Cameron, Janet Donkervoort, Ruth Ann Drozd, Ian Fleck, Tom Jeffery, Debbie Kemp, Michael Kernahan, David Laphorne, Patrick Laurin, Jain Mahabir, Joan Mansell, Marg McCullough, Linda McKenna, Bill McMurchy, Nancy Newell, Barbara Nyitray, Angela Osborne, Don Speir, Gerald Stocking, Joan Taylor, Donna Jean Van Bilsen, Trudy Van Der Hoek, Peter VanderKooy, Elders; John Van Eyk, Lay Missionary; Lu Brule, Treasurer; Carrie Thornton, Clerk; Sharon Gilchrist, Karen Carroll, Alan Carroll, Annie Isobel Tait, Kay Dymock, Tom McLarty, Argyle Presbyterian Church; Paul McWilliam, Duff Presbyterian Church; Ross MacKay, Knollwood Presbyterian Church.
- Regrets** John Bannerman, William Khalil, Amanda MacMillan, Michael Stol, Ministers; Sheila McMurray, Nancy Springer, Elders.
- Absent** Deb Dolbear-VanBilsen, Ryan Kim, Mark Turner, Ministers; Matt Marshall, Sandra VanDerVeen, Elders.
- Notice of Motion** **MOTION:** (Shaw/Fleck) THAT the motion to place Rev. Ryan Kim on a paid leave of absence be reconsidered. NOT CARRIED.
- The Moderator invited the visitors from Argyle and Duff to stay for the remainder of the meeting but gave them permission to leave if they wished.
- Students and Education Team** **MOTION:** (Shaw/Baron) THAT the Rev. John Bannerman be granted permission to attend the annual Association of Presbyterian Church Educators (APCE) event. CARRIED.
- Denominational Work Team** K. Steeper advised Court of opportunity to nominate individuals for membership on a General Assembly committee. The deadline is February 28, 2014. Nomination forms are available from K. Steeper.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

MOTION: (Steeper/Van der Hoek) THAT Biennial General Assemblies be approved. CARRIED.

**Vacancy and
Visitation Team**

R.A. Drozd presented the reported previously circulated.

MOTION: (Currie/Drozd) THAT Rev. Kathy Fraser be commended for a meaningful ministry at Knox Komoka and North Caradoc-St. Andrew's Presbyterian Churches and for her work within the presbytery. CARRIED.

MOTION: (Currie/Drozd) THAT the congregations of Knox, Komoka and North Caradoc-St. Andrew's Presbyterian Churches be commended for their ministries and work. CARRIED.

MOTION: (Currie/Drozd) THAT the topic of the division of expenses between the two congregations be discussed at a joint Board/Session meeting under the guidance of the interim moderator prior to pursuing a call to a new minister. CARRIED.

MOTION: (Currie/Drozd) Given that the presbytery is undergoing a process of revisioning, that the Sessions of both churches have the opportunity to discuss alternate ministry arrangements at individual Session meetings (although they may decide to remain together as a two point charge) prior to pursuing a call to a new minister. CARRIED.

MOTION: (Currie/Drozd) THAT following these discussions regarding division of expense and possibilities of alternate ministry arrangements, a search committee be formed to begin the process of searching for a new minister. CARRIED.

MOTION: (Jeffery/Baron) THAT the visitation team to Knox and North Caradoc-St. Andrew's be dismissed with the thanks of the Court. CARRIED.

**Leading with
Care Team**

K. Steeper reported for the committee. Correspondence has been sent to Trinity Presbyterian Church regarding Leading With Care policies and the committee hopes to arrange a meeting with Trinity in the near future.

**Mission and
Evangelism Team.**

No report.

**Hospital Visitor
Team**

No report.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

Youth and Campus Ministries The report of the team was circulated with the advance reports. H. Paton reminded the Court about the One Day Wonder and thanked the volunteers who assembled and distributed the care packages.

Website and Communications Team No report.

Small Church Ministries Team No report.

Reports of Interim Moderators Knox, Fingal – E. Hoekstra presented a verbal report. Ministry is continuing and the sacraments are being celebrated, a meeting was held with St. James to explore options; the congregation is still pursuing the search for a half-time minister but realizes there are other options.

St. James, North Yarmouth – The Clerk read the report sent by J. Bannerman. Worship continues, the manse is still on the market, a congregational photo Directory is being produced, an informal and constructive meeting was held with Knox, Fingal to explore various possibilities.

St. John's, Port Stanley – C. Brown provided a verbal report. Ministry continues and the visioning team continues to meet.

Knollwood Park, London – J. Redpath provided a written report. The church building has been sold and the sale closes on February 28, 2014. The final regular worship service is February 23, 2014. A service of celebration will be held in the evening and is open to the Presbytery. Invitations will be sent to the dinner.

Knox, Komoka/North Caradoc-St. Andrew's – K. Ballagh-Steeper provided a verbal report. The sessions are meeting, the pulpit is being supplied, the search committee is waiting while ministry options are explored.

Other Business The Moderator has appointed Rev. R. Shaw interim moderator of Argyle and Duff Presbyterian Churches.

Adjournment On a motion by I. Fleck, the Court stood adjourned at forty minutes after nine o'clock in the evening, to meet again in Regular Session on Tuesday, the

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

eleventh day of February, two thousand and fourteen, at seven o'clock in the evening, in Strathroy/Middlesex County, and within North Caradoc-St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church.

The Moderator closed the meeting with prayer.

Moderator

Clerk

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

**Report of the Presbytery Visitation Committee to
The Pastoral Charge of Duff Church, Largie and
Argyle Church, Crinan**

December 13, 2013
London, Ontario

At the November meeting of the Presbytery of London, the Presbytery voted to allow the pastoral charge of Duff Church, Largie and Argyle Church, Crinan to move to half-time ministry effective January 1, 2014. The Presbytery further decided that the Reverend Ryan Kim would receive a four month transition allowance of full time stipend and allowances beginning January 1, 2014. This transition allowance would assist Mr. Kim as he moved into half-time ministry. The committee was also given the direction by the Presbytery to discuss with the pastoral charge its future ministry goals and objectives. The committee was asked to report back in June 2014 to the Presbytery.

The committee now needs to report more than diligence. There have been several significant developments that have occurred since the November report within the pastoral charge and concerning the ministry of the Rev. Ryan Kim.

Background:

The committee intended to meet with the Rev. Ryan Kim and the sessions of the pastoral charge to discuss what part-time ministry in practical terms. The committee intended to discuss matters such as time allocation and the delivery of pastoral care when a minister is working half-time. A meeting was called for December 4, 2013 in the evening.

The committee also knew that there had been four letters of concern sent to the session of Duff Church, Largie and one to the Presbytery of London. All had been transmitted to Clerk of Presbytery who in turn was about to pass them on later that day, through the administration team, to the committee to assist in its work.

On December 3, 2013 the convener, Keith McKee, learned that Mr. Kim was not going to be in attendance at the meeting the following evening. Mr. Kim planned to take a week of vacation to visit an uncle in the United States. The convener learned of this decision second hand through another committee member. Reluctantly the convener cancelled the meeting as Mr. Kim's presence was essential.

The Clerk of Session of Duff Church, Largie called the convener to express the concerns of the Session of that congregation related to three matters:

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

- (1) The ongoing pastoral care of the congregation. The concern was raised that pastoral care is not being given effectively to members of Duff Church, Largie.
- (2) The Kim family are not participating in worship at Duff Church, Largie.
- (3) The source of Ryan Kim's sermons was a matter of significant concern. Ryan Kim prints his sermons for people to read during the service and take home with them. Two elders took home some of these sermons and did an internet search on certain sentences from them. It appeared to them that Mr. Kim has appropriated these sermons from a single source, a Korean United Methodist congregation.

Regarding the later point, the convener called these two elders. Both shared their stories and subsequently the sermons themselves in written form. The convener found the sermons were indeed posted on the website of the Korean United Methodist Church of Greater Washington. Recognizing the seriousness of this matter, he called a committee meeting with Ryan Kim for December 12, 2013 in the morning. In order to be fully transparent, Mr. Kim was informed that the team would be discussing with him his sermons and that Mr. Kim clearly did not prepare them himself.

Mr. Kim agreed to the meeting. The next day Mr. Kim also called to visit the convener at his office. Mr. Kim admitted that, using the internet, he appropriated all his sermons from that source from May 2013 to December 2013. He never cited the source of his sermons and presented them verbatim as his own work. He also printed them and distributed them as his own work.

The Convener told Mr. Kim that not only were his actions, in his opinion, unethical, they were also illegal. The American Church and its minister copyrighted the sermons. The site contains the disclaimer that it does not permit the use of any or all of content of these sermons without written permission. Mr. Kim did not seek permission to use the material. Mr. Kim was also urged to seek out pastoral care and was told that he could bring another minister with him to the meeting on the 12th of December if he so wanted. The convener informed him of this verbally and in writing via email. The convener prayed with Mr. Kim.

The convener consulted the Rev. Don Muir, the Deputy Clerk of General Assembly, who confirmed that appropriation of another's sermons from the internet had the potential to be a judicial matter within the Church courts and also potentially a legal matter before the Canadian law courts.

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

Meeting of December 12, 2013

The committee met at 9:45 am on December 12, 2013 to discuss the agenda of the meeting. The letters of concern had been received by the committee. Mr. Kim also had received copies of these letters of concern. The committee agreed to put these letters aside for the moment to discuss the matter of Mr. Kim's appropriation of sermons online and the implications of that action within the pastoral charge. The committee needed to discuss with Mr. Kim his impressions of his ability to lead both congregations in ministry in the future. Mr. Kim joined the committee meeting at 10:10 am. Ryan brought with him the Reverend Mike Beacom, a retired minister within the United Church of Canada who was an adherent of Argyle Church, Crinan.

The committee appreciated Ryan Kim's willingness to confess that since May 2013 he has not preached a sermon of his own preparation. All sermons have been taken from the same online source and preached verbatim, except for some editing to make the sermons a bit shorter in duration. Mr. Kim knows that what he did was unethical and in his words "dishonourable." Mr. Kim explained that, since May, there have been financial problems within the pastoral charge and that concerns had been expressed to him about his English language skills. Mr. Kim concluded that he was unequipped to prepare satisfactory sermons. He therefore chose to find a source for sermons online.

The Rev. Ryan Kim approaches his mistake with contrition. He came to the meeting with his own understanding that he needed to apologise for his actions to the congregations, to confess his mistakes, and to seek forgiveness. Mr. Beacom expressed his concern that "around town" people are discussing that Ryan has been getting his sermons off of the internet. Mr. Kim hopes that he would be forgiven by the pastoral charge. The committee encouraged Ryan in his decision to confess his inappropriate actions, to apologise for them, and to seek the forgiveness of the congregations. The committee further hopes that talk of this matter will soon cease within the churches and community. The committee prays that the congregations will receive Ryan Kim's apology and extend to him forgiveness.

No member of the committee is seeking to bring a charge against Mr. Kim that would result in judicial process according to Chapter Nine of the Book of Forms. However, Mr. Kim was made aware that any member of his congregation or a member of Presbytery could bring a charge against him. This would result in the commencement of a judicial process.

In its prayer that grace will prevail, the committee recognizes that Mr. Kim is a new minister in a pastoral charge that differs from any other experience he has ever had. The pastoral charge is exclusively English speaking; English is Mr. Kim's second language. The pastoral charge is rural; Mr. Kim has only lived and worked in urban settings. There are two congregations in the pastoral

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

charge that have responded differently to Ryan's ministry. There are significant financial constraints within the charge that have resulted in discussions about and a move to half-time ministry. The committee believes that Ryan is trying to honourably deal with something that he did that was wrong in order to try to put it right.

Mr. Kim further discussed with the committee his future ministry within the pastoral charge of Duff Church, Largie and Argyle Church, Crinan. After some reflection with the committee, and in private consultation with his advisor, Mr. Kim concluded that he needed to resign from the pastoral charge after the transition allowance ended. Mr. Kim himself understands that he has lost the confidence of the session and a significant number of people at Duff Church, Largie and perhaps now at Argyle Church, Crinan. It is Mr. Kim's intention that he will announce his decision to ask Presbytery's permission to resign on Sunday, December 15, 2013 and communicate in writing this decision and intention to the Clerk of Presbytery immediately.

Mr. Kim is in Canada on a work permit. He applied in July for permanent residency. If his application is approved, he will be able to remain in Canada.

If Presbytery approves this resignation Mr. Kim will work half-time from January through April, 2014. During this time, Mr. Kim plans to look for another pastoral charge in which to minister. Mr. Kim was encouraged also to continue to receive pastoral care during this time of transition.

Other Concerns:

The committee discussed with the Rev. Ryan Kim other concerns related to his ability to minister in an English-speaking congregation. Mr. Kim recognizes that he has significant language problems. He had hoped that by working within the charge, his English would improve. Some elders have noted to the committee some improvement; others have noticed no improvement. At times it can be very difficult to understand what Mr. Kim is saying. The committee has received over the course of its work several emails from Mr. Kim. They all contain spelling and grammar errors. At times it is difficult to decipher what Ryan is writing. As noted above, Mr. Kim intends to seek another call within the denomination and, should he seek a call to an English-speaking congregation, his English skills need to improve. The committee concludes that would not be fair to either Mr. Kim or another pastoral charge within the Presbyterian Church in Canada for this Presbytery to transfer Ryan Kim without attempting to deal with these language issues.

The committee is therefore recommending to Presbytery

That, before any future call is processed to Mr. Kim, he seek private tutoring or classes in effective writing and communications and that he demonstrate that his English language skills have improved.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

Mr. Kim's situation is not unusual. The convener searched out through contacts in the community two different sources of help for Ryan Kim. One is a specialized tutor in English for students and professionals. The other is an independent learning academy that teaches effective writing and communications for adults. In order to implement the above recommendation it is suggested that Mr. Kim use his study leave funds for tutoring/education. The committee would be able to ascertain if his writing skills are improving by reading regularly Mr. Kim's sermons that he prints for members of his congregations. The committee will report back its observations and conclusions to Presbytery in a few months. Mr. Kim agreed to the above recommendation because he knows he must improve his English. By his own admission, his English is "not good enough" for the work he is called to do. Mr. Kim also called his English language skills "his disability." Any improvement would be of benefit to both Mr. Kim and a future pastoral charge he would serve.

The Rev. Ryan Kim thanked the committee for its support. The Rev. Mike Beacom was thanked by the committee for providing Ryan with pastoral care and for being present at the meeting

In light of the fact that Ryan Kim is both apologising for his recent actions and announcing his intention to ask Presbytery's permission to resign from the pastoral charge the next Sunday (December 15, 2013), the committee concluded it needed to visit the sessions as soon as possible.

A meeting was called for Friday, December 20, 2013 at ten o'clock in the morning. Mrs. Ruth Ann Drozd further volunteered to attend worship at both congregations on the aforementioned Sunday.

The convener prayed for Ryan Kim, his family, and the congregations. Mr. Kim and Mr. Beacom retired from the meeting.

Further Reflections:

Working closely with Ryan Kim and the congregations throughout this process, the committee also concluded that it needs to express to the Presbytery of London another concern. Mr. Kim graduated from Knox College, Toronto with a Master of Divinity degree. Yet, by his own admission, his English language skills are not satisfactory to do the work he has been called to do in an English-speaking congregation. The committee cannot understand how Mr. Kim graduated from a masters-level program with the significant communication issues he has.

Along with language often comes culture. The committee has observed that Mr. Kim appeared ill prepared to understand the dynamics of a rural parish within the Canadian context. The Sessions were then put in the position of trying to educate Ryan Kim about rural Canadian ministry.

The committee also recognizes that Ryan Kim has difficulty understanding Presbyterian polity. At various times he has confused the roles of minister, Session and Presbytery. This has affected

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

his ability to provide leadership in the congregations. Again, the committee wonders how Mr. Kim could graduate with a limited understanding of Presbyterianism. This has resulted in the Session members having to assume leadership roles that should have been the minister's.

The committee concludes that it needs to do more than just talk about these issues or lament them.

The issues need to be addressed with the academic leadership of Knox College. Therefore the committee recommends

THAT the Reverend Keith McKee and the Moderator of Presbytery meet with the Rev. Dr. Dorcas Gordon, Principal of Knox College and the Rev. Dr. Pamela McCarroll, Assistant Professor of Pastoral Theology & Director of Theological Field Education to express the committee's concerns about the preparedness of ministers for whom English is a second language and for whom Canadian Presbyterian culture may not be their own.

If the Presbytery agrees to the above recommendation, a report on that meeting will be presented to the court.

Finally, the committee understands that the Vacancy and Visitation Committee is working with the Administration Committee of Presbytery to consider how calls are processed within the Presbytery of London to make sure that congregations are financially able to support the minister whom they are calling and to sustain that support in the future.

The committee further cautions interim moderators and congregations to inquire if candidates for a vacancy are Canadian citizens or permanent residents and to seek out legal advice and the advice of the Ministry and Church Vocations Office of the national Church before agreeing to and signing an extended work permit. The matter of the work permit was of significant concern throughout this visitation to the pastoral charge. The committee was unaware of the work permit until it commenced its work. The committee, nor the Sessions of the charge, wanted to do anything to jeopardize Mr. Kim's residency in Canada. Mr. Kim has assured the committee that he has sought legal advice and will be able to stay in Canada after April 30, 2014.

Conclusion:

This committee was named in September to visit the pastoral charge of Duff Church, Largie and Argyle Church, Crinan. The committee was apprised of the financial concerns of the pastoral charge and problems with the condition of manse. The committee prepared a lengthy report for the November meeting of the Presbytery. Much has transpired since that meeting. Some of it has been positive. The committee has been well received by the sessions of the pastoral charge. Mr.

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

Kim has moved into a house in Dutton on a rental basis. The home inspection has been sent to the Clerk of Session of Duff Church, Largie for assistance as the congregation considers what to do in terms of manse repairs.

Some of what has transpired has been very painful. The committee appreciates the honesty of the sessions in speaking up about their problems, financial and ministerial. The committee also appreciates that the Rev. Ryan Kim has acknowledged his mistakes and his limitations in ministry. It is hoped that Ryan Kim has learned from this experience and can seek out further education and tutoring to resolve the difficulties he is experiencing. We also encourage him to continue to receive pastoral care from the Rev. Mike Beacom with whom Ryan Kim appears very comfortable.

The committee plans to meet with the Session of Duff Church, Largie to discuss the five letters of concern. They are not complaints, but rather letters of concern about Mr. Kim's ministry. Some of the concerns mirror closely those already discussed in this report. The committee does need to speak to Mr. Kim about how to provide pastoral care to members of a congregation if there is conflict within that congregation.

The pastoral charge, Mr. Kim and Mr. Kim's family remain in the committee's prayers. The convener opened and closed the meeting of December 12, 2013 with prayer.

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

**Supplementary Report of the Committee to
Visit Argyle Church, Crinan and Duff Church, Largie**

The committee (Keith McKee, convener, Ruth Ann Drozd, Donna Jean Van Bilsen, and Heather Paton) met on January 8, 2014 prior to meeting with the Sessions of Argyle Church, Crinan and Duff Church, Largie. The Rev. Andrew Reid also attended the committee meeting to bring the perspective of the administration team to the discussions.

The committee concluded that there were four areas that needed to be explored in the discussions with the sessions and with the Reverend Ryan Kim at the meetings to be held on Thursday, January 9, 2014.

1. The Presbytery of London at its November meeting approved the transition to part-time ministry for the Reverend Ryan with a transition allowance of full-time stipend and allowances for four months beginning January 1, 2014. The sessions needed to consider time allocation and management for ministerial duties in a two-point charge with an average work week being twenty-two hours. So too does Ryan Kim.
2. The Committee needed to ascertain how the congregations and sessions were reacting to the news that Mr. Kim had appropriated sermons for the past several months. The advanced report that was circulated to the Presbytery was also circulated to the session members. This was done to be fully transparent with all concerned. Ryan Kim apologized for his actions to the congregations on Sunday, December 15, 2013 and announced his intention to resign effective April 30, 2014. (He actually apologized but did not give a date of his resignation; that date was announced on Sunday, January 5, 2014 in the bulletin. Mr. Kim sent a letter to Presbytery with this resignation date. The congregations would need to be cited to appear at a Presbytery meeting to process the resignation; that cannot be done for the January 14, 2014 meeting of Presbytery.)
3. The Committee is aware of tensions between the two congregations as a result of differing perspectives of the ministerial performance of Mr. Kim. The Committee endeavours to facilitate a way towards healing that long-standing pastoral relationship that the two congregations have enjoyed.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

4. The Presbytery of London at its November meeting instructed the committee to work with the congregations on a visioning exercise for its future. As much as the present concerns are occupying the congregations and the committee's time, looking ahead to the future is very important.

The Presbytery should note that since the time of the circulation of the report dated December 13, 2013 to the court, an elder from Duff Church, Largie shared with the convener sermons dating back to the winter of 2013. The convener located the source of these sermons on the internet. These sermons were taken once again from the Korean United Methodist Church of Greater Washington. Ryan Kim acknowledged to the Convener in a telephone call that these sermons were indeed appropriated and that he had not told the truth to the committee about when the appropriation of sermons began. Ryan Kim indicated that he began to take the sermons from the on line source in May 2013. The practice began before May 2013.

Meeting with the Session of Argyle Church, Crinan

On Thursday, January 8, 2014 the committee met with the Session of Argyle Church, Crinan at 10:30 am. All members were in attendance. The Committee reviewed what part-time ministry looks like weekly and monthly in a pastoral charge, noting that this is a two-point charge.

The committee listened as the session affirmed its respect for the pastoral work that the Rev. Ryan Kim has done in their congregation during his ministry. Several letters of support of Ryan Kim were given the session and some were read to the committee. Time did not allow all these letters to be read during the meeting.

The Session also expressed a sincere desire to forgive Ryan Kim for appropriating sermons. When asked, the convener told the session that Ryan Kim was aware that what he was doing was unethical. The Convener reiterated the seriousness of plagiarising another minister's work. Ministers are called to a Ministry of Word and Sacrament and Mr. Kim was not producing his own sermons for his specific congregations. Instead, without permission of the author, he was using another's work. A discussion occurred about how ministers prepare sermons and why it is important to prepare sermons to meet the specific needs and situations of an individual pastoral charge. One session member volunteered to say that he suspected Ryan was obtaining his sermons somewhere, because the sermons sounded too sophisticated to be Ryan's own composition.

The Session felt that the session of Duff Church, Largie wants to get rid of Ryan Kim as soon as possible. However, the session of Argyle Church, Crinan did not want to end or jeopardize the partnership that the two congregations enjoyed for years.

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

The Session understood that it must be very difficult for Mr. Kim to preach in Duff Church, Largie when the congregation really does not want him to be present. The convener asked the session to consider if it would be in agreement to a paid leave of absence of Mr. Kim from February 1st to April 30th. The leave of absence would be for both congregations. It would give Ryan Kim an opportunity to concentrate on moving beyond these difficult past few months and to concentrate on his English language skills. While the session does not like to see Ryan Kim cease being with them on Sundays, the session unanimously agreed that if Ryan was in agreement with a leave of absence, the session would agree to it. Of course, the Presbytery would need to agree to the leave of absence as well.

A further recommendation would be that the Presbytery would pay the cost of pulpit supply and interim moderator's costs during this three month leave of absence.

The Session reviewed the report of December 13, 2013 with the team. The Session wanted to affirm their respect and esteem for the ministry of Ryan Kim.

The Session also felt that not enough background work had been done to prepare for the move to full-time ministry from part-time ministry when Ryan was called in 2011. The session asked the Presbytery to examine the finances of a charge more carefully when proceeding with the moderation of a call.

The meeting was opened and closed with prayer by the convener.

Meeting with the Session of Duff Church, Largie

The committee met at 1:30 PM on January 9, 2014 with the session of Duff, Church, Largie. All but one session member were present. The session expressed deep frustration that Ryan had resigned effective April 30, 2014. The session concluded that it would have been the honourable thing for Ryan Kim to resign much sooner than April. The session suggested January 31, 2014.. There were many reasons for this conclusion. First, Ryan Kim had, to the best of their knowledge, preached appropriated sermons for about a year. The session concluded that this action was reprehensible and illegal. The session felt that it reflected badly not only upon Ryan Kim, but upon the congregation and the wider Presbyterian Church in Canada, including its ministers. Second, they concluded that Ryan Kim had provided very little pastoral care of the membership of Duff Church, Largie. The Session drew the committee's attention to some people in the church whose elders have asked Ryan to visit and whom Ryan had not visited. In the session's opinion in the business world, Ryan would be given the opportunity to resign or be immediately dismissed without a severance allowance for the lack of fulfillment of the requirements of his job. Finally, the session members believe that the relationship with Mr. Kim has deteriorated to the point that it did not feel that Ryan should return to the pulpit. They cited

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

the fact that his family no longer is present at Largie and he not engaged in the community of Largie or Dutton in any way to show that Ryan Kim has left them already. The pastoral relationship has broken down and it is beyond the point of repair.

The session also expressed concern about the moderation of the call. They felt they were not fully prepared for the expenses of a full-time ministry.

Session members did not want a judicial process to begin against Ryan Kim in either the Church courts or the legal courts of Canada. Members expressed hope that Ryan Kim will learn from this experience, get the help that he needs to improve his English, and never again repeat his mistakes in any congregation in the future.

The Session asked the committee to enquire of Ryan Kim if he would consider resignation on January 31, 2014.

The convener asked if a leave of absence from the charge, effective February 1 to April 30, 2014, would be helpful for the charge. The congregations would be responsible for the payment of his stipend and allowances. A recommendation would be presented to the Presbytery of London that the Presbytery would be responsible for the costs for Ryan Kim's pulpit supply and the costs of the interim moderator. Initially, the session was reluctant to envision paying Mr. Kim through to the end of April.

The convener then asked all present to step back and review the events that led up to this current situation. In October the team met with the Sessions to resolve the housing issue and that was done amicably with both sessions and Ryan Kim.. Ryan Kim and his family have a new home. The Presbytery committee worked with Mr. Kim and the sessions to recommend to Presbytery that the charge move from full-time ministry to half time ministry effective January 1, 2014. That decision was reached in November. In December, the session learned the source of the weekly sermons and the committee responded in a timely manner. Ryan Kim apologised for his behaviour and resigned. The committee has been responsive to the ongoing concerns of the session of Duff Church, Largie as well as the session of Argyle Church, Crinan.

The tone of the meeting changed. The convener thanked the session for its openness in fully airing their concerns and opinions. The committee was thanked for the hard work it has done to this point.

The session reiterated that it wanted the committee to ask Ryan Kim to resign effective January 31, 2014 in light of his actions regarding the appropriation of his sermons from the internet this past year and because he has been absent from their congregation, in the session's perspective, for some time. However, the session agreed that if Ryan Kim is not in agreement with resigning on

Minutes of the Presbytery of London

Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.

January 31, 2014, it would be better for him to be on a leave of absence. This would begin healing within the congregation and would give Ryan time to reflect upon his future ministry and obtain better English language skills.

As was done at Argyle Church, Crinan, it was explained that two months notice had to be given at the house in which the Kim family was living and if Mr. Kim wished to remain in the house after April 30, 2014 a separate rental agreement between the landlord and him would have to be reached.

The meeting ended on a friendlier note than when it began. The meeting was opened and closed with prayer by the convener. Mrs. Donna Jean Van Bilsen retired from this meeting because of a work commitment.

Meeting with the Rev. Ryan Kim

At 3:00 PM committee members Ruth Ann Drozd, Heather Paton, and the convener met with the Rev. Ryan Kim and his advisor Rev. Mike Beacom.

The committee re-stated the history of this committee, including the relocation of the Kim family to a home in Dutton, the transition of the charge to part-time ministry effective January 1, 2014, and the recent discovery of the appropriation of the sermons.

The committee explained that it heard words of support for Ryan's ministry from the session of Argyle Church, Crinan. The session was not pleased with learning that Mr. Kim appropriated his sermons, but has accepted his apology.

The committee also explained the profound upset of Duff Church, Largie at learning that the sermons were appropriated this year and their frustration at the lack of pastoral care being offered the congregation for the past several months. At times Ryan's advisor felt that the convener and the committee were dwelling too much on the negative aspects of taking sermons from the internet. The convener calmly explained that the committee felt that not only were Mr. Kim's actions unethical, they were and remain illegal.

Mr. Kim was asked directly how long he had been obtaining his sermons from the internet. Mr. Kim responded for two years and three months. Mr. Kim was inducted on April 3, 2011. That means that for only four and half months he prepared and delivered his own sermons. The committee was disheartened to hear this. This activity was going on for much longer than Mr. Kim first led the committee to believe. In fact, he lied to the committee on December 12, 2013 when he stated that this activity only occurred from May 2013 to December 2013.

Mr. Kim apologised. In his defense he set that he felt "theologically uncertain" as to how to

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

prepare sermons for an English speaking congregation and he did not feel that he possessed English language skills to prepare well a sermon. The committee pressed Mr. Kim to define “theological uncertainty.” Mr. Kim could not really articulate a response.

Mr. Kim has met with the Tutor Doctor and will send a quotation to the convener about the costs of tutoring to improve both his written and oral English skills.

The convener also mentioned that the session of Duff Church, Largie was unhappy with the delivery of pastoral care to the congregation. Mr. Kim responded that he tried to make some visits, but was unable to at times.

The convener explained the session of Duff Church, Largie’s request that he resign effective January 31, 2014. This would, of course, have an adverse financial implication for the Kim family.

The convener also explained that if Mr. Kim were take a leave of absence effective February 1, 2014 he would not be in the position of preaching at Duff Church, Largie, a congregation that simply does not want to see his ministry continue there. The convener explained that reluctantly the session of Argyle Church, Crinan would support such a leave of absence if Ryan Kim agreed to it.

The convener explained that the Rev. Ryan Kim would be paid until April 30, 2014 but would have no responsibilities in the congregations. A recommendation would be going forward to Presbytery that the Presbytery pay for the cost of pulpit supply and the cost of the interim moderator during the time of the leave of absence.

It was also explained to Mr. Kim that the sessions of the charge had to give two months notice to the landlord to end the rental agreement. If Mr. Kim wished to remain in the house after April 30, 2014 a separate rental agreement between the landlord and him would have to be reached.

Mr. Kim agreed to consider to the request of Duff Church, Largie for an earlier resignation and his conclusions about the possibility of a leave of absence. That leave would have to have Presbytery approval. Mr. Kim promised to get back to the convener as soon as possible.

January 10, 2014

Ryan Kim indicated in a telephone call that he was not prepared to resign on January 21, 2014. He was prepared to begin a leave of absence from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014.

It is the committee’s conclusion that the pastoral relationship between Mr. Kim and Duff Church, Largie had been broken beyond repair. It was felt that Mr. Kim’s presence in the pulpit of that

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

church would be detrimental to the congregation. It was also felt that it would be extremely painful for Mr. Kim to be in that congregation. The committee also did not believe it prudent to ask Mr. Kim to take a leave from one congregation and not the other. This would cause further division between the two congregations.

Therefore the committee recommends:

That Ryan Kim be placed on a paid leave of absence from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014.

The committee further recommends:

That the cost of pulpit supply from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014 be paid from the General Funds of the Presbytery of London.

The ongoing work of the charge needs to continue. As with any extended leave of absence a moderator pro tem would be appointed. In this case, it is hoped that the moderator pro tem would become the interim moderator of the charge.

Therefore the committee recommends:

That power to issue be given the Moderator of Presbytery to appoint an interim moderator and that the costs of the interim moderator be paid by the Presbytery of London from February 1, 2014 to April 30, 2014.

Ryan Kim has consulted with the Tutor Doctor about individual tutoring to improve his written and oral English language skills. Improvement in these abilities is needed before another call can be processed to Mr. Kim.

Therefore the committee recommends:

That the Presbytery of London pay up to \$2500 to offset the costs of Mr. Kim's tutoring in English and that the Presbytery of London receive reports that Mr. Kim is indeed engaging in tutoring and is making progress.

The committee is concerned that if Mr. Kim plans to search actively for a call to another pastoral charge, that charge be aware of the issues that Mr. Kim has had within the pastoral charge of Argyle Church, Crinan and Duff Church, Largie. The Presbytery and Mr. Kim both need to be fully transparent about what has transpired. This would prove to be helpful for Mr. Kim if he

**Minutes of the Presbytery of London
Burns Presbyterian Church, Mosa, Tuesday, January 14, 2014, 7:00 p.m.**

moves to another Presbytery. That Presbytery could perhaps provide ongoing mentorship for Mr. Kim.

Therefore, in order to be fully transparent, the committee recommends

That this report and the report of the committee dated December 13, 2013 be attached to the minutes of the Presbytery and the certificate of Mr. Kim.

Attaching these reports to the certificate of Mr. Kim is not a disciplinary action. A future Presbytery would not be obliged to keep these reports with Mr. Kim's certificate indefinitely as the Presbytery would have to do if disciplinary action had been taken. The committee, however, strongly feels, that any future Presbytery at any future time needs to be aware of what transpired during Mr. Kim's ministry within the Argyle Church, Crinan and Duff Church, Largie pastoral charge.

Conclusions:

Throughout this process, the committee has kept the Rev. Ryan Kim in its prayers. Mr. Kim struggles linguistically. The committee feels he was not prepared to move from the experience of Korean culture to a rural two-point charge in Southern Ontario. He further had concerns related to the manse. Lastly, his ministry was received much differently in the individual congregations. It was natural, therefore, for him to become closer to the congregation that responded affectionately to him than the congregation that challenged him.

The committee believes that Mr. Kim understands the gravity of his mistake in appropriating his sermons. The committee did not conclude it was necessary to commence formal judicial process although what he did was serious enough to warrant an investigation committee.

While the committee encourages Mr. Kim to get help with English, the committee also encourages Mr. Kim to reflect on whether or not his ministry lies in an English speaking congregation.

The committee commends the sessions of Argyle Church, Crinan and Duff Church, Largie for their openness to work with this committee. Much pain has been experienced by both sessions. Both sessions have been supportive of Mr. Kim. Both sessions realize now the need to move on from this ministry to other ministry options. Visioning within the charge is needed.

The committee will remain in place to assist with that visioning and to be of support to Mr. Kim and the sessions during the leave of absence and past the date of resignation. Finally, the resignation of Mr. Kim still needs to be approved by Presbytery and the congregations need to be cited to appear at that meeting.